P.21

G R S 58
Previous references

1907
(Education)

File No 238-06

Serial Nos 164

Later references

GENERAL AND REVENUE SECRETARIAT

Serial Nos 164

Part B for April 1907

Subject

Easy text books on Bhuvevarane and Charitre for Primary classes C/P A Subject No 279 of 1906.

1 ~~From~~ To the D/Ed^n No 5656 & 29 12 06
Forwards for report R A Subject c/p 279-06 re Balabhuvevarane and Mr. Marsden's Charitre Primary Classes

2 From the same No 5212-13/418 & 22 1 07
States that the Charge against Balabhuvevarane appears to be too well-founded and forwards a c/s of Marsden's letter stating that the book (Charitre) has been revised in the manner suggested by Mr Balakrishna Rao

3. From Mr RS Balakrishna Rao, Letter & 9 3 07 Forwarding Copies of correspondence between him & Mr Marsden

4 To the D/Ed^n Mr Balakrishna Rao No 9388-9/Ed^n 238-06-4 & 6
Records the above with certain observations.

GPB 8,000—7-4-08

GRS 11] 1906-07

GENEPAL AND REVENUI SECI ETARIAT

(Educaten)

NOTES

File No 238-06

FILE HFADING

Easy text books on Bluewarane and Chambre for Primary classes (R A Subject no 279 of 1906)

From

No	Dated	Received	
Diary No	Enclos	Spare Copies	Serial No

BRIEF ABSTRACT OF LETTER

	NOTES AND ORDERS
Sl no 1	To the Inspector General of Education in Mysore Docket no 5656 of 29 12 06 Forwards for report R A Subject no 279 of 1906 and the reply of Govt thereto in re the use of Bala Bluewarane & Mrs Marsden's Chambre in Primary classes

NOTES—First sheet

GPB—30 000—20 3 06

GRS 12]
General and Revenue Secretariat

Ed File No 238 of 1906-07

Serial No

2

From the Ag Inspector General of Education
Letter no 5212-13 & 418 & 22 10 07
States with reference to Sl no 1 that the
Charges against Bala Bhushana appear to
be only too well founded, the book being too long
& too full of detail and the language being in
Some places beyond the Standard of the pupils
for whom it is intended and that as soon as the
Text Book Committee is pressed, a Small Sub-
Committee will be appointed to revise it carefully
or write a new book, States also that in the
meantime advantage is being taken of the
opportunity of having to bring out a new edition
of the book, to have Some portions of the book
printed in Small type So that these may be passed
over in the Lower Classes, this Step being a remedy in
the grievance as a temporary measure pending
the preparation of a carefully revised edition,
forwards also with reference to Mr Marsden's
history a copy of Mr Marsden's letter dt 20 10 07 stating
that the book has been altered or modified in
the manner suggested by Mr BalaKrishnaRao
& that the Changes would be made in the next edition
of the book Copies translations of the book
& States that Mr Marsden has also been addressed
with a Suggestion to revise the English edition
of the book also

NOTE—Contn sheet

GPB—50 000 23 10 06

GRS 12J
General and Revenue
Secretariat

7694 3

Ed File No 238 of 1906-07

Serial No	
	Mr S R Balakrishna Rao who took exception to the books in question has been requested in this office no 2110 of 6 9 06 to state if he has communicated with Mr Marsden regarding the passages in Mr Marsden's history, objected to by him & if so with what result (Please See Confdl no 27 A of 1906 put up)
	Submitted for orders as to whether a reply promised to the above reference from Mr Balakrishna Rao may be awaited
	Reminder 12 07 — Yes JB 13/2/07
3	From Mr S R Balakrishna Rao Shimoga letter of 9 3 07
	Forwards copies of correspondence between Mr Marsden & himself and states that Mr Marsden having accepted his criticisms on certain objectionable passages in his Kannada history of India, has agreed to insert the corrections in later editions of the book but that Mr Marsden did not consent to publish the correspondence on the subject.
	Submitted with a draft—
2435 28-3-07	Reminder 21 3 07 — JB 26/3/07 — 27/3/07
	Approved 5/4/07 — Yes JB 5/4/07

Note—Contn sheet

GPB—00000 23,000a

GRS 12]
General and Revenue Secretariat

Ed File No 238 — of 1906-07

Serial No	
4	To the Inspector General of Education and Mr R S Balakrishna Rao, BA LLB, Advocate and Representative member, Shimoga Sir — Forwards Govt Proceedings No 9388-9 Edn 238-06-4 dated 10 4 07 in reply to Letter No 5212-3 dated 22-1-07 from the Dy of Edn 418 and letter dated 9th March 07 from Mr Balakrishnarao, to the effect that Text Books for Schools should be written by persons who possess a liking for and Sympathy with the subject treated, and familiarity with the most recent standard works thereon

NOTE—Continuation sheet

GPB—40 000—12 5 06

D5500

SUBJECT No 279

Kannada Te t book /—
(1) B la Bhuv va a e
(2) Cha itre

M S R B lakr hna Rao A
s Sh m ga M pality

Summary of discussion —(1) Bala Bhuvivarane is quite beyond the standard of the primary classes for which it is intended A book written in a simpler style containing only notes of important places may be prescribed

(2) Mr Marsden s Charitre contains an inaccurate account of Ramayana Young boys are not to be given any chance of entertaining mistaken notions of historical facts and much less of rel gious lessons

Reply of Government —(1) Under consideration

(2) Under correspondence

Sub 76
06. To The Dy Sl of Edn in Mysore

No 5858 Dy 29 12 06

Ed(238 06)-1

Has the honor to forward Part-(2) of the marginally noted R A ~~Subject~~ of 1906 and the Reply of Govt thereto for Report

By order

29/12/06

for Secretary

Sub

Part (2) about Marsden's Charitre to under Correspondence with the R A Number Necessary action will be taken after the Reply is Received from the Number.

23/12/06

23/12/06

22-12-06

D 6601

Edn 81j

OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL OF EDUCATION IN MYSORE,

No 3212-13 / 418 *Bangalore* 22nd January 1907

Ed 258-06
Sl-2

From

J Weir Esq J A
~~H J BHABHA Esq M A~~

Ag *Inspector General of Education in Mysore*

To

K S Chandrasekhara Aiyar Esq B A B L

Secretary to the Government of H H the Maharaja of Mysore

General and Revenue Departments Bangalore

SIR

With reference to your letter No 3000 / Ed (208-00)-1 dated 29th December 1900 I have the honor to submit the following report -

Reg 0

I Bala Bhuvivarane

The charges brought against this book appear to be only too well founded It is too long and too full of detail and the language is in some places beyond the standard of the pupils for whom it is intended As soon as the Text-Book Committee is revised a small sub-committee will be appointed to revise it carefully or write a new book

In the mean time as the present edition is almost exhausted a new edition is being printed to prevent the financial loss to Government and the disorganization that ensues in this department when a text-book is allowed to get out of print Advantage is being taken of this opportunity to print some portions of the book in smaller type so that these may be passed over in the lowest class It is hoped that this will do something to remove the grievance as a temporary measure pending the preparation of a carefully revised edition

II Mr. Marsden's Charitre

In continuation of this office No 1922 / 108 dated 7th September 1906 I have the honor to inform you that Mr Marsden writes as follows -

Calcutta,

January 20th. 1907

Sir

With reference to your letter No 10071 / 993 dated 23rd June 1906, I beg to state that I have heard from Mr. Balakrishna Rao B A B L Shimoga who took exception to certain statements in my Indian History

The objections raised by the gentleman are very easily met I have altered or modified all the passages to which he takes exception, in the way that he suggests These changes will be made in the next editions of the Canarese translations

I have the honor to be, Sir
Your most obedient servant,
(Sd) B Marsden
Inspector of Schools (retired)

This is satisfactory so far as it goes but it still leaves the English edition with some offensive passages untouched Accordingly I have sent to Mr Marsden a copy of Mr Ragnunatha Rao's criticism and suggested a revision of the English edition as well.

I have the honor to be
Sir
your most obedient servant

Ag Inspector General

L B

GRS 45

27A

GOVERNMENT OF HIS HIGHNESS
THE MAHARAJA OF MYSORE

GENERAL AND REVENUE DEPARTMENT

No 7511 dated the 4-3-1907

(Edn)

To

S R Balakrishna Rao Esq
B A & LB, Advocate
Shimoga R M

Subject

Requests him to say if he has communicated with Mr Marsden in re the passages objected to by him in Marsden's book on Indian History & if so with what result?

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

The undersigned is directed to invite attention to the marginally noted communication and to request that the General and Revenue Secretariat may be informed in the column opposite of the cause of delay in furnishing a reply and of the approximate date on which a reply may be expected

He is also to request that the General and Revenue Secretariat may be favoured with a reply to the reminder not later than the 19th march 07

*No 2110 dated 6/9/06

B O T

for Secy

* Previous reminder

6198d 10 1 07

GPB—12 000—9-4 06

W 4123 Vrl 5,11

D 7694

REPLY Ed 338 of 06
8 4 5

No dated the 7th March 1907

Shimoga

To

The Secretary to the Government of
H H the Maharaja of Mysore
General and Revenue Dept

Sir,

I beg to enclose herewith Copies of the correspondence that has passed between Mr Marsden & myself — Mr Marsden has accepted my criticisms & has agreed to effect the necessary Corrections in his next book He has given directions to his publishers to insert the necessary Corrections in the Copies that may be published Mr Marsden did not consent — to publish the Corrections in question, which I do not mind as I am to do on the ground given by the reading pages an opportunity of correcting the books in actual use

I am Sir
Your most obedient servant
S. R. Balakrishna Rao
Advocate
Retd

To

E Marsden Esqr I.E.S. M.R.A.S.

Retired Senior Inspector of Schools Madras

C/o

Messrs

Macmillan & Co Ltd

St-Martins Street

London W C

(Cheltenham)

Sir,

With reference to your letter dated (Cheltenham) 1st July 06 to the Inspector-General of Education in Mysore in reply to the Cutters letter no 10071/993 of 23 6 1906 to your publishers Messrs Macmillan & Co, in the matter of my representation in the Representative Assembly that your books on Indian History in Kannada, Contained some inaccurate accounts of Ramayana etc

I have the honor to state as follows ——

I am the member that mooted the Subject in Mysore Assembly in 1905 The passages to which I take objection in your books are detailed below

I R. Easy lessons in Indian History (Kannada by Mr S G Narasimhachar)

Ramayana page 5 para 5 (ರಾಮನ ತಂದೆಗೆ ಇಬ್ಬರು ಹೆಂಡತಿಯರು (Ramas father had two wives) This is incorrect Ramas father had three wives

page 13 para 11 ರಾಮನ (ರಾಜನ) ಮರಣಾನಂತರ ಅವನನ್ನು ದೇವರೆಂದು ಪೂಜಿಸಿದರು

" ನ (After his (Rama's)

ನ ದೇವರು (because he was worshipped by the Hindus as a God) This is inaccurate As a matter of fact Rama was being looked upon & even worshipped as a deity even while he was alive

Note — These may be looked upon as minor inaccuracies But the Subject Ramayana is not only a History but even a Religious work to the Hindu He finds in this work the incarnation

Macmillan & Co ltd

of Vishnu, appearing in flesh + blood,
the sole object of punishing wickedness
The morality taught by the work is of a
very high order If inaccurate account
of such a Hero-deity as Rama is put into
the hands of young Hindu Boys & makes them
non-believers in all things which are held
sacred by the Hindus They will be induced
to question the correctness of Valmiki
(the author of Ramayana) having learnt
an incorrect account of it from your book

Page 64 para 3

" ఛత్రపతి వాఁ బింబ్యాఁ కాఁ పింబ్రా ఇవఁ వ్యక్తిరాఁ)
బ్రిట్ఁ లిని రాఁ ర్ఫ్ ర్ఫ్ రాఁ రాఁ ర్ఫ్ ఁబ్రిట్ ర్ఫ్ ర్ఫ్ రాఁ
రాఁ ర్ఫ్ ర్ఫ్ రాఁ రాఁ రాఁ ఁబ్రిట్ ర్ఫ్ రాఁ రాఁ రాఁ

This is incorrect Shivaji was never a
thief, nor was Hyder a dacoit Shivaji
was actuated by the best of motives viz
the establishment of a Hindu Sovereignty
in Hindustan - the land of Hindus Both of
these historical personages were founders
of Kingdoms Any Country & any nationality
may be proud of such heroes To speak
of them as thieves & teach the same lesson
to the young Indians is to ask them to have
no regard for their historical heroes

I Should like that reference to such heroes may be made in a way that would Command the respect of young Indians

Also Marsdens book

(History of India for Middle Schools)

Part I

Page 25 Para (3) ఆతనిని (కృష్ణుని) మానవాతీత వంతుడుగా
ఆనం॥ చేసి దివ్యంగా తలచి పూజించిరి (This is
inaccurate) He was worshipped
as God even while he was
appearing in flesh & blood &

Para (4) ఆతనిని గురించిన (ఆ యా) కథలు
కల్పిత మైన Mahabharata is a
History & not a mere Story
(So also Ramayana) This is again
lacking in that Veneration
which is generally associated
with these epics Kindly
Consider these Corrections &
make necessary alterations
in your two books

Shimoga
12th Dec. 06

I am Sir,
Your most obedient Servant
S. R Balasubramanya
Advocate &
Representative Members

True Copy
Balasubramanya
8/2/15

To Macmillan & Co Ltd

Mr Balakrishnan 83a 16L St Martins Street

London W C 4th Jan 1917

My dear Sir,

I am in receipt of your letter of December 12 which reached me at Calcutta a few days ago

I am now sending you by book-post a copy of my Easy Lessons from Indian History Please see pp 8 55

I do not know why Mr Narasimhachar said that Dasaratha had two wives You will see (page 8) that I say he had three wives.

2. In the Chapter on Shivaji (of whom I am a great admirer) I do not say that he was a thief In the Chapter on Hyder I say that he like Hyder began life as a robber There was no disgrace I think as many English & Scotish heroes such as William Wallace and Hereward the Wake and Robin Hood are said to have done the same But I have deleted these words as you will see I do not think Hyder can be for a moment be compared with Shivaji I have no admiration for him and I do not see how a Mysorean like yourself can be proud of him when you remember how he

quarrel the ancient many
enemies he was guilty of Nevertheless I have altered
on p 88, as you will see

See also changes on pp 8 & 12

I have made similar changes in the larger book,
also omitting the words that the Ramayana
has no real history at all By this I meant no
History with dates as modern writers understand
History I had made these and some other
similar changes in my proof to the new English
edition before I heard from you I
quite agree with you that all Indian boys
particularly while they are young, should
look with veneration on their Sacred books In
these days, when so much irreligion & irreverence for
what is old & Sacred is spreading over the Country,
it is very necessary that all boys should be
taught to reverence their own religion. When they
grow up and enter College, they may with advantage
learn to criticise books as Historians do

I will see that the changes I have
mentioned are made in the next edition
& the Kanarese translations I am very grateful
to you, my dear Sir, for calling my attention to them

I am
Yours Obly
Sd E. Marsden
Inspector of Schools (retired)

True Copy
Bangalore 8/3/01
Chelmsford

To

E Marsden Esqr BA

Circle Inspector (Retired)

C/o Messrs

MacMillan & Co Ltd

Book Sellers etc

Bombay

Sir,

I beg to acknowledge receipt of your letter dated Madras 17th Gamary & thank you for the same I also received Copy of your Easy lessons from Indian Stories so kindly sent to me

2 I agree with you that Hyder Cannot at all be Compared with Shivaji The latter Stands on a higher level morally intellectually & politically My objection was as much regarding your reference to Hyder as regarding your reference to Shivaji the latter built an Empire while the former (Hyder) usurped the reins of Govt from his master

3 I desire to express my sense of gratefulness to you for the very kind way in which You have received my humble

rite address & I am Convinced that dogmatism has no place in you & that you have set to welfare of Indian Students at heart

4 I am sorry your translator Mr. Narasimhachar has not faithfully translated the original He is a Hindu, a born-Mysorean, a Kannadiga man and a well and authorised — Nay even a professional - Translator My own idea of this business is that the person undertaking it must translate both the language and the Spirit of the original passages

5 I have a great desire to publish the interesting Correspondence that has been going on between us My first object in doing so is to let the public know the passages objected to & expunge them from the books now in use My other object is to Convince the public that the Govt of His Highness the Maharaja are always ready to value sound public opinion & act up to it, that the Representative Assembly is doing some useful work and that You are actuated by the best of motives in publishing your books for the use of Indian Students

I am, dear Sir
Yours faithfully
S R Balasundaram

Shimoga
15/2/07

"Hon Colls
R Balasundaram"
9.3.07

C/o

Macmillan & Co

Calcutta

Feb 21 1907

My dear Sir

In reply to your letter dated Feb 15th just received

Pray do not publish the Correspondence at present it might lead to Complications & Cause the difficulty

I will send you Copy of the new edition when published and will if you like furnish you with a para for the papers myself with the new edition

It would please boys and teachers very much to expunge any thing from books actually in use The present edition will run out very shortly & the new edition will I think satisfy you

I will alter several passages besides these you mention, I am altering the next edition of the English book in the same way

I am, dear Sir

Yours faithfully

Sd E Marsden,

True copy

W Salomons

9 2 07 Advocate Shillong

GRS 28]

Entered

19/4

Ed File No 238-06
Serial No 4

Diary No of letter replied to _____

Proceedings of the Government of His Highness the Maharaja of Mysore

GENERAL AND REVENUE SECRETARIAT
( )

the 190

Date of issue 10 4 07

Signed by _____

(1) as to Bale Bhimvarane

READ —

Letter no 5212-3/418 dated the 22nd January '07 from the Inspector Genl of Education in reporte stating, with reference to this office docket no 5656/Ed 238-06-1 of the 29th December 06, that the Charge brought against ~~the~~ ~~Bale Bhimvarane~~ ~~Omkar Thekeon~~ No. in the book (~~Bale Bhimvarane~~) ~~Bale Bhimvarane~~ in R.A. Inspn of the R.A. no 279 of 1906 appears to be well-founded as the book is too long and too full of detail and the language thereof is in some places beyond the standard of the pupils for whom it is intended and that as soon as

(Vide Enclosed)

over

SUBJECT

~~Resolved the Auditor~~ Secretary

the Text-book Committee is revised
a small Sub-Committee will be appointed
to peruse the book or write a new one, the
new edition being in the meantime
printed in small type so that these
may be passed over in the lowest class,
~~thus being hoped to~~ & thus remove the grievance
as a temporary measure pending the preparation
of a carefully revised edition and
(2) as to Mr. Marsden's Chambre, that
the passages therein, to which exception
was taken by ~~Mr. S. Balakrishna Rao~~ the Representative member, have been ~~Hinted~~ taken
by Mr. Marsden to ~~have been~~ be altered or
modified in the future editions of the
Kanarese translations and that ~~Mr.~~ a perusal
of the English edition of the book as well has been suggested to Mr.
Marsden. ~~has been suggested and accepted~~

~~to pursue the~~

2 Letter of 9th March '07 from Mr.
S. R. Balakrishna Rao Representative
member stating, with reference to this
office no. 2110 of the 6th September '06,
~~Stating~~ that Mr. Marsden
has ~~agreed~~ accepted his criticisms
and agreed to effect the necessary

GRS 27]

GENERAL AND REVENUE SECRETARIAT

(Continuation Sheet half form)

Print

It is evident that Legislators business should be written by persons who have a taken for sympathy with the subject treated, and dealt with the most recent standard works thereon -

Print

corrections in the new edition of the book and forwarding copies of correspondence between Mr Marsden & himself on the subject

Order thereon 9388-9
& in 2386-4
9/10/07

Recorded

Marsden presented

Secretary
9/3/07

26/3/07

To ~~The D.C. of Education~~
The Deputy Director of Education
Mr S R Balakrishna Rao
B A L L B
Advocate & R A member
Shimoga

Copy forwarded both copies of the correspondence received from Mr Bala-Krishna Rao to the Inspector General of Education, with a request that he will draw the attention of Mr Marsden Translator to para 4 of Mr Balakrishna Rao's letter to Mr Marsden of 15th February 1907 for

Marked the article

I [illegible]

his [illegible] guidance in
translating works of the
kind referred to in future

Romer

Secy

FB
26/3